

Women's Design Service

Evaluation of the Making Safer Places Project

August 2004

By Jenny Phaure, JMP Consultancy

Contents Page

Acknowledgements	p.3
1. Introduction	p.4
1.1 What is the Making Safer Places Project?	
1.2 Purpose of the evaluation	
1.3 Methodology	
2. Executive Summary	p.6
2.1 Key findings	
2.2 Recommendations	
3. Community Safety Audit Training and Development Work	p.9
3.1 Background	
3.2 A review of training planning and content	
3.3 A review of CSA training in Bristol	
3.4 A review of CSA training in Manchester	
4. Promoting a gender perspective	p.22
4.1 Background	
4.2 The extent of the work	
4.3 A review of practice at a local level	
5 Promoting work with organisations to engage with women	p.30
5.1 Background	
5.2 Links established between women and local organisations	
5.3 A review of training, events and awareness raising activity	
6. Local, Regional and National Networks on Community Safety	p.33
6.1 A review of practice	
6.2 Ideas for strengthening the National Networks and profile of the MSP project	
6.3 Ideas for taking forward local Networks	
6.4 Further suggestions	

Acknowledgements

WDS would like to thank all those who participated in the evaluation or who have given their time to assisting with the development of the MSP project in the last 2 years.

Particular thanks go to:

- All the women in each Community Safety Audit group in Manchester and Bristol
- Hannah Berry, Manchester Women's Network
- Alison Blunt, London Women and Planning Forum, Queen Mary University
- Sara Brown, Regional Manager, Crime Concern
- Zoe Goddard, Private Sector Housing, Manchester City Council
- Steve Lawson, EC1 NDC Community Development Worker
- Sabrina McAndrew, Community Safety, Bristol Inner City Community Safety Unit
- Kathy McGowen, Northmoor Community Association, Manchester
- Helen Mott, Chair of Bristol Women's Forum
- Ruth Pitter, VOSCUR, Bristol
- Sue Smith, Oxfam ReGender (Oxfam UKPP)
- Liz Sprenger, Safety in Northmoor, Manchester
- Anne Walder, Women's Advisor, Bristol Women's Forum
- Mirian Walton, CSA participant/Easton and Lawrence Hill Neighbourhood Renewal Team
- Marion Williams, Service Improvement and Inclusion Team, Manchester City Council
- Margaret Wilkinson, Head of Projects and Development, Neighbourhood Initiatives Foundation
- Jan Youngs, Equality Officer, Bristol City Council
- Safety in Northmoor group
- Baptist Mills CSA group

Thanks to Christine Heath (administrative officer at WDS) for her support in setting up the interviews for the evaluation of the MSP project.

Thanks also to Harriet Wilkins and Hawah Bunduka for their work on the MSP project.

1. Introduction

1.1 What is the Making Safer Places Project?

The Women's Design Service (WDS) are managing a 3 year project funded by the Community Fund. The Making Safer Places (MSP) project is a pilot project focused on enabling women in urban environments to feel safe in going about their every day lives. The MSP project seeks to bring women's experiences and perspectives onto the neighbourhood renewal and community safety agenda. In doing this it is envisaged that women may enjoy a greater sense of safety, develop their self confidence, develop economic and social independence and contribute to a more sustainable community life.

The MSP project started in November 2002. The project is currently working in Bristol and Manchester with plans to start work in the London Borough of Islington. Manchester City Council and the Bristol Women's Forum (BWF) are the existing project partners. MSP is specifically interested in the experience of Black and minority ethnic women, older women and disabled women, whose social and physical vulnerability (real and perceived) affects their quality of life. The wider community in urban areas and policy/decision makers with a renewal and community safety remit are also key interest groups for the project.

Key project objectives as outlined in the original Community Fund application and three year business plan (2002-2005) are to:

- train and support women living in communities to engage with community safety issues
- promote a gender perspective on community safety policy and practice
- work with organisations in the community, voluntary, academic and statutory sectors to engage with women on community safety issues
- convene a network on gender and community safety

Making Safer Places is a fully funded project with two designated workers. A Steering Group with local and national representatives provides strategic direction as well as guidance, support and expertise to the project. The Steering Group meets three times a year.

1.2 Purpose of the evaluation

The primary purpose of the evaluation is to:

- evaluate project progress against Community Fund milestones and targets across three locations (Manchester, Bristol and London)
- identify project strengths, examples of good practice and areas for improvement
- present a set of key findings against main project activity areas and propose recommendations to inform the second half of the project

The original Community Fund application and updated business plan 2002-2005 outline a number of key areas for monitoring and evaluating activity. An independent consultant, JMP Consultancy, has sought to review project activity against the main project objectives (as outlined in 1.1) and Community Fund Outcomes (MSP Business Plan 2002-2005)

1.3 Methodology

A range of methods were utilised in undertaking the review of the MSP project, including:

- Face to face and phone interviews (17)
- Return of questionnaire (1)
- MSP Steering Group meeting (8 in attendance)
- Paper review
- Review of all MSP project electronic files held at WDS

2. Executive Summary

2.1 Key findings

Community Safety Audit Training and Development Work

- The quality and standard of work undertaken in relation to the Community Safety Audits has been extremely high. Feedback from women and local partners indicates a high degree of satisfaction, respect and commitment to the CSA process.
- The initial contacts, planning and training programmes are extensive. Each of the programmes (in Bristol and Manchester) represent a model of good practice in relation to promoting gender awareness at a local level
- The Community Fund targets in relation to outcomes have largely been met. The target number of women to have been trained by November 2003 is slightly lower than in the original bid (probably due to a slightly later start date)
- The Community Safety Audit (CSA) programmes in Bristol and Manchester have both been effective in increasing women's confidence in the local urban environment and improving perceptions of community safety (largely due to increased knowledge of the local community and people living in the area)
- Whilst both Manchester and Bristol produced final audit reports the recommendations for improving the built environment have so far only been taken forward in Manchester
- The CSA work in Manchester was linked directly to one of the Community Safety priorities "Women's Voices" and the audit recommendations were formulated in conjunction with local planners and city engineers
- The CSA in Bristol did not fit strategically with any local priorities. Whilst gender awareness is considered important there is a lot more work to be undertaken on influencing policy makers and ensuring a wider understanding of the CSA process as part of the Equalities agenda
- Links have been made with the EC1 New Deal Programme but CSA work has not yet commenced in London

Promoting a gender perspective

- The Policy Development Worker (PDW) undertook extensive initial research and networking (local, national and international) in relation to Gender Mainstreaming
- A successful joint training event was undertaken with Oxfam ReGender in Manchester entitled "Valuing Gender in Regeneration". The event was well attended.

- The “Valuing Gender in Regeneration” Conference produced a set of practical steps to be taken forward at a local level. Both Manchester and Bristol MSP need to ensure that these steps are followed up.
- Many publications, articles and good practice toolkits were researched and circulated to local partners across Bristol and Manchester in relation to Gender Mainstreaming
- A comprehensive baseline survey format was developed in relation to gender awareness, impact assessment and evaluation.
- Findings from each local baseline survey indicates that whilst there is a strong commitment to gender awareness/gender mainstreaming few of the good practice areas are currently being implemented
- The level of focus on Gender across Bristol is minimal. Whilst all new policies are Equalities Impact Assessed there is limited professional knowledge of the value or purpose of Gender Mainstreaming.
- Both Manchester and Bristol identified the need to undertake local professional training on Gender Mainstreaming. The MSP needs to promote a stronger link between local policies and national obligations to meet European Union and Central Government Standards on Equalities
- Policy Development Work has not yet started in London so there has been no review of practice in this area

Promoting work with organisations to engage with women

- A wide range of contacts were made with statutory and voluntary organisations across Manchester and Bristol including women's groups
- Many of the women participating in the CSA training were also linked into local women's partnerships, networks and forums
- There have been a considerable number of community presentations on the MSP and CSA findings across Bristol and Manchester
- The project has been successful in promoting contact with organisations working with women, older women and women with disabilities
- The MSP project exceeded its target of training 40 professionals across 40 organisations on Gender Mainstreaming by November 2004.
- Whilst there have been a range of training/awareness raising events held in Manchester and London there has not yet been an event/conference in Bristol
- There is a need to take forward tailored local training for professionals and community organisations

Local, Regional and National Networks on Community Safety

- The PDW was successful in pursuing contacts and information on networks at a local, national and international level
- An extensive range of information and resources were gathered in relation to Gender Mainstreaming and good practice models for Women's Community Safety Networks
- Work on developing Community Safety Networks has not yet begun. A number of useful ideas for taking this work forward were generated by the MSP Steering Group and the PDW/TDW prior to leaving (including making stronger connections between the local MSP project and national/international policy priorities)

Recommendations

- 1) For the Training and Development Worker and Policy Development Worker to prioritise a programme of Gender Mainstreaming Training with professionals and organisations across all three locations
- 2) For the Policy Development Worker to prioritise work in the following areas:
 - Ensuring that the next programme of CSA training in Bristol fits with one of the local priorities action plans that might attract funding for physical improvements
 - Re-visit the baseline surveys across Bristol and Manchester (gathering more information from a wider range of organisations). Utilise this information and the findings within this report to strengthen the case for a local Gender Mainstreaming training programme
 - Consult with partners across the three locations to ascertain the best way of developing a Community Safety Network (utilise the ideas generated within this report as a starting point)
 - Create stronger linkage between national/international policy and local priorities action plans in relation to Gender Mainstreaming
 - Explore options for enhancing networks/communication locally, nationally and internationally through the development of a more interactive web site
 - Begin policy development work in London, utilising the lessons learnt in Bristol and Manchester
 - Continue to build the links with national and international organisations focusing on Gender Mainstreaming
 - Ensure that the practical steps from the "Valuing Gender in Regeneration" Conference are taken forward
 - Liaise with the Equalities Team in Bristol in relation to taking Gender Impact Assessment Work around Making Safer Places issues forward within the Council
- 3) For the Training Development Worker to prioritise work in the following areas:

- Work to develop a programme of training that can be offered to professionals and organisations (across the three locations) on Gender Mainstreaming
- Utilise the range of toolkits and resources that have been gathered on Gender Mainstreaming as part of local training programmes
- Establish a community awareness/training programme on Gender Mainstreaming across the three locations
- Establish a CSA group in London (identifying a location that fits with project criteria and is linked to a local policy/strategic priority)
- Begin to consult with local partners across Manchester and Bristol on the location of the 2nd CSA group
- Re-establish contact with the women who participated in the first CSA's in Bristol and Manchester
- Continue to work with the Policy Development Worker in undertaking community presentations, workshops and events

3. Community Safety Audit Training and Development Work

Key findings

- The CSA programme in Bristol and Manchester have both been effective in increasing women's confidence in the local urban environment and improving perceptions of community safety (largely due to increased knowledge of the local community and people living in the area)
- Whilst both Manchester and Bristol produced final audit reports the recommendations for improving the built environment have only been taken forward in Manchester to date.
- The CSA work in Manchester was linked directly to one of the Community Safety priorities "Women's Voices" and the audit recommendations were formulated in conjunction with local planners and city engineers
- The CSA in Bristol did not fit strategically with any local priorities. Whilst gender awareness is considered important there is a lot more work to be undertaken on influencing policy makers and ensuring a wider understanding of the CSA process as part of the Equalities agenda
- The quality and standard of work undertaken in relation to the CSA's has been extremely high. Feedback from women and local partners indicates a high degree satisfaction, respect and commitment to the CSA process.
- The initial contacts, planning and training programmes are extensive. Each of the programmes represents a model of good practice in relation to promoting gender awareness at a local level
- The Community Fund targets in relation to outcomes have largely been met. The target number of women to have been trained by November 2003 is slightly lower than in the original bid (probably due to a slightly later start date)
- Links have been made with the EC1 New Deal Programme but CSA work has not yet commenced in London

3.1 Background

- Making Safer Places uses a Community Safety Audit tool with a group of women who live or work in the area.
- The Community Safety Audit method is a capacity building programme, enabling women to identify factors in an area that makes them feel unsafe, and to recommend what and how it should be changed.
- The Community Safety Audit consists of 7 key activities: discussion, mapping, observation, recording, analysis, presentation and implementation.
- It was envisaged that a total of 2 courses targeting 32 individuals and 10 organisations would have been completed by November 2003 (Business plan 2002-2005)

3.2 A review of training planning and content

The paper review found that:

- An extensive range of contacts had been established within Manchester and Bristol including statutory and voluntary/community organisations.
- Whilst contacts have been made with the EC1 New Deal Area in London no work on progressing CSA training has yet started. An outline proposal for funding to support the MSP project in Islington was submitted to the EC1New Deal Partnership. The area criteria for undertaking CSA work has been circulated to the EC1 Community Development Workers. This is a significant area of work to be taken forward by the new Training Development Worker
- A comprehensive database of contacts for support to each Community Safety Audit Group had been developed by the Training and Development Worker.
- Many groups listed on the contact database files included those groups working with Black and Minority Ethnic Communities, Disabled People and Women (including older women)
- A comprehensive CSA Training Schedule involving 11 sessions was developed. The Training Schedule outlined the objectives and learning outcomes for each session. The schedule demonstrates the breadth and depth of the training planned incorporating key elements such as: aims of the project, considering the design of the local area, looking at maps/models/plans, the audit process, reading the built environment, documenting observations, presenting audit findings and raising community awareness of community safety issues
- Each individual session was backed up by training resources and materials including: key audit questions, exercise to build audit roles, case studies to develop analysis skills, use of the story board as a means of presenting information, a breakdown of the key elements to the implementation stage of the audit
- Feedback forms for CSA training participants were acquired for each session
- Each community audit completed was recorded and an aggregated record sheet produced with key findings and scores.
- Summary reports from each area were produced by the women in conjunction with the Training and Development Worker (TDW) as key resources for presenting audit findings and influencing changes to the local built environment and Community Safety Policy

3.3 A review of CSA training in Bristol

Review Area	Key findings
<p>Establishment of the CSA training sessions</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Early contacts were established with a range of key players to identify an appropriate area for targeting CSA training and development work. • The TDW built up good working relationships with the Community Safety Co-ordinator from the Safer Bristol Partnership, a representative resident from the Bristol Women's Forum (BWF) and the Equalities Officer from Bristol City Council's Equalities and Social Inclusion Team • One local resident within the CSA Group, interested in looking at Community Safety from a women's perspective, took up a local job as neighbourhood facilitator for the Neighbourhood Renewal Area of Easton whilst involved in the project. There were clear links to the new role which strengthened community involvement in the project (via local links and networks) and also served to raise the profile of the project amongst local policy makers • A representative from the BWF was also involved as a local resident and played a key role in reporting back to the BWF and into the Equalities Unit at Bristol Cities Council • Whilst good links were established feedback indicates that the benefits of the training and raised awareness of the process amongst policy makers was limited by the scope of the project (location, time etc)
<p>Level of women's involvement in the training (ethnicity, age, disability)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Baptist Mills/Millpond CSA Audit Group Interim Report (May 2004) records that a total of eight women from the Millpond area in Easton took part in the Community Safety Audit. • The CSA training started on 27th January 2004 and eleven sessions were held. • Most of the women described themselves as pedestrians and cyclists. • There was good representation within the

	<p>group across race and age demonstrating that the project had been successful in meeting Community Fund target groups (BME community representation included Somali, Pakistani and Asian whilst the upper age was over 65)</p>
<p>Outcomes from the audit</p>	<p>a) One significant outcome from the audit was <u>the production of an Interim Report (May 2004)</u>. The report is extremely clear in presenting key issues in the following areas:</p> <p>The audit process</p> <p>Key community safety issues: fast cars in residential areas, crossing the M32, underpasses, poor lighting and dangerous rubbish including syringes and condoms</p> <p>Identification of the most perceived unsafe areas</p> <p>The benefits of the audit: one of the major benefits of the audit was cited by women in the group as enabling them to feel stronger and more empowered as their eyes were opened to the issues in the area</p> <p>An analysis of the audit findings in relation to the five priority areas</p> <p>A presentation of key recommendations to inform local community safety policy/awareness and urban design, including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • extra policing/wardens in priority areas • improving the built environment through locating a pedestrian crossing on lower Ashley Road, Warwick Road and the top to St Mark's Road so that there is an integrated pedestrian route from the heart of Easton to Ashley, installing help points at the M32 footbridge and underpass to help make it feel less isolated and vulnerable <p><u>b) Findings against Community Fund outcome targets</u> (scored 1-5 with 1 being low and 5 high) amongst five respondents participating in the evaluation key findings are as follows:</p> <p>Women are more confident:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • This was seen as one of the most significant

	<p>outcomes from the CSA with two scoring 5, two scoring 4 and one scoring 3.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Respondents indicated that women felt more confident about their environment through acquired knowledge (the audit), more confident talking with other women and expressing their views to local policy makers/members of the public. <p>Women feel safer:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Safety was improved in relation to perception of danger with four respondents scoring 4 and one respondent scoring 1.• Through participating in the street audits women described their sense of safety as improving by developing knowledge of the area and talking to local people including some of the young people on the streets (that may have previously been perceived as a threat).• Actual improvements to safety in relation to the built environment were seen as minimal at present whilst local architects and designers had been briefed on the recommendations (this was work in progress). <p>Women can work together as self directed groups</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• One respondent did not know whether the group had experience of working/meeting on their own.• Overall respondents thought that since the TDW had left in May 2004 the motivation of the group had reduced indicating that self direction and management could be strengthened.• Three respondents scored 3, one scored 4 and one scored one. <p>Women are knowledgeable about the policy structures in their neighbourhoods</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Two respondents indicated that whilst women had met with representatives from community safety and urban planning/design knowledge of how policy structures worked was still limited.• One woman didn't think that understanding the structures was the best use of volunteers
--	--

	<p>time whilst a further two respondents felt that there was scope for further extending women's involvement in local policy discussions.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• One local policy worker indicated that whilst the strategic elements of the project had been plugged locally the project has not been invited to become a part of the local planning process (in relation to community safety).• The scope of the project could be widened with a greater emphasis on raising awareness of the project and its approach (particularly the audit work) as a means of meeting national and local standards on Gender and Equality• Four respondents scored 3, one scored 2. <p>Women are knowledgeable about community safety issues</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Increased knowledge of community safety issues was described in relation to greater awareness of Easton (via the CSA) and its potential hazard's.• The audit itself was seen as raising local awareness of the built environment.• One woman indicated that the audit findings confirmed issues relating to local community safety that had previously been raised with local policy makers and planners (e.g. that the M32 crossing was unsafe and a potential hazard for robbery)• Women in the audit group had been involved in the development of a local article. Three women reported that whilst they did not read local community safety reports they were more attentive to community safety articles in the local paper• Two respondents scored 4, two respondents scored 5 and one scored 3 <p>Women are able to facilitate community safety audits</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Four out of five respondents thought that women would be able to undertake community safety audits in another context. Respondents indicated that with further training and support there was considerable scope for women to undertake more Community Safety Audits
--	--

	<p>independently</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There was concern that if the group was not re-convened and given new direction a lot of the motivation may be lost • Three respondents scored 5 and two scored 4 (demonstrating the confidence in the skills that women have acquired through the CSA training)
<p>Implementation of the audit findings</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Baptist Mills/Millpond MSP Interim Report (May 2004) indicates that considerable efforts have been made to raise the profile of the audit recommendations and take forward their implementation. • The project has been liaising with Sustrans, Bristol City Council and the Inner City Community Safety Unit to consider ways of taking the preliminary recommendations forward • The paper review found evidence of presentation formats that had been developed to raise the profile of the audit findings. • A schedule of presentations was set out in the Interim Report including presentations to the M32 Steering Group, Bristol Women's Forum, Easton Leisure Centre, Easton Resident's Network • Feedback from the women in the audit group indicates that whilst the presentations have been well received the project has still not managed to influence some of the key local policy makers • Equalities indicated that whilst the benefits of working with the local women are recognised gender is not high enough up the list to influence local planning and decision making. Currently race is the big driver under the banner of "Social Inclusion." • The review found that there is enormous scope for widening awareness in relation to European Standards and local requirements in relation to Gender and Equality. The benefits and process of the Community Safety Audit linked to local priorities could form part of a local practitioner/professional training programme. In this way the connections can be made between the project work, local, national and international policy

3.4 A review of CSA training in Manchester

Review Area	Key findings
Establishment of the CSA training sessions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Early contact was made with the Community Safety Officer (Manchester City Council) to identify how the MSP could fit strategically with local Community Safety Priorities • A good fit was identified with "Women's Voices" a local themed group • An initial presentation by the CSA TDW on the audit training and process was delivered in the early stages of the project • There was active involvement in relation to the projects development from the Service Improvement and Inclusion Team and the Crime and Disorder Team. This involvement ensured that the CSA was targeted at areas where there were known concerns in relation to women and safety • Northmoor Community Association was identified as a key local venue and resource for supporting the CSA women's group • The Neighbourhood Renewal Community Link Worker was also involved in the CSA group providing additional support • The level of support that the project received and strategic involvement from the Crime and Disorder Team highlights Manchester Council's commitment to promoting gender awareness practice and policies at a local level. The themed group "women's voices" has given the project the strong strategic link that is needed to ensure that CSA outcomes are implemented
Level of women's involvement in the training (ethnicity, age, disability)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Safety in Northmoor CSA Audit Group Interim Report (September 2003) records that a total of eight women from the Northmoor Road Area took part in the Community Safety Audit • Eleven two hour sessions were held at the Northmoor Community Centre on Thursday afternoons from June to September 2003 • There was good representation within the group across race and age demonstrating that

	<p>the project had been successful in meeting Community Fund target groups (there was representation from the Pakistani, Indian and Black African communities, four women were aged 25-39, 3 women were aged 40-64 and 1 woman was over 65)</p>
<p>Outcomes from the audit</p>	<p>a) One significant outcome from the audit was <u>the production of an Interim Report (September 2003).</u> The report is extremely clear in presenting key issues in the following areas:</p> <p>The audit process Key community safety issues: Quiet/empty streets at night, young children/men/women hanging around street corners, fear of being mugged due to drug addicts, back lanes, fast cars speeding down Northmoor Road, waste ground spots, dark and dirty tunnel</p> <p>Identification of the most perceived unsafe areas Crowcroft Park Play Area, Alleyway behind Grainger Avenue, Alleyway between Hopkins and Hatton Streets, Corner of Northmoor Road and Elgar Street, Pedestrian Tunnel connecting Parry Road and Stockport Road</p> <p>The benefits of the audit Women that participated in the CSA identified a number of key benefits including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • forming friendships with women from other nationalities living within the Northmoor Area • bringing different sections of the community together • learning to share and review ideas together • learning to take a broader view of safety (examining experiences and facts) • learning more about the local community and the people that live there • learning how to analyse the local environment and examining how an area can change at different parts of the day <p>An analysis of the audit findings</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The group analysed the information from their observation points and focused on two areas for improvement (the areas used most in the community – Northmoor Road and the tunnel between Parry Road and Stockport Road)

A presentation of key recommendations

Ideas for improvement were developed in conjunction with the Community Technical Aid Centre (CTAC) and Manchester Engineering Design Consultancy (MEDC).

Key recommendations included:

- **Northmoor Road:** to develop designated parking a pedestrian crossing and clearer bus stop areas
- **Tunnel between Parry Road and Stockport Road:** brighten up the tunnel, reduce the litter/vandalism, improve landscaping of the embankments
- **Community activities:** more evening activities, organised journeys from and to community events, development of community projects which improve understanding between the young and the old

The partnership with CTAC and MEDC demonstrated the level of local commitment to taking forward the CSA findings in developing workable local solutions.

The solutions also emphasise the importance of improving community capacity alongside the built environment as an important part of Gender Mainstreaming

b) Findings against Community Fund outcome

targets (scored 1-5 with 1 being low and 5 high) amongst six respondents participating in the evaluation key findings are as follows:

Women are more confident:

- Women felt more confident talking within the audit group but still had concerns about taking on community leadership roles (partly due to lack of time)
- Women from the CSA group reported that their levels of confidence had increased when talking to people in positions of authority
- One woman described herself as pro-active in communicating with local council departments, leisure services and city engineers
- Out of 6 respondents 4 scored 3 for improved confidence whilst 2 scored 2

Women feel safer:

	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Overall women reported feeling much safer in the area.• Women from the CSA group reported that following local presentations on the audit findings they felt listened to. The City Council had agreed to respond to recommendations in relation to the pedestrian crossing on Northmoor Road and improving the tunnel at Parry Road.• Women saw these responses as definite outcomes for the project, outcomes that would improve safety for local women in the community (particularly those with children)• Whilst the physical changes to the environment haven't happened a number of women felt safety had also improved because of getting to know the local community better. Visiting specific areas and meeting local young people had helped to dispel the myth that young people are a threat and improved women's perception of safety in the area.• By learning about the local environment women had also learnt how to avoid the areas pitfalls• No specific scores were recorded for this area <p>Women can work together as self directed groups</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• The women from the CSA group felt they had worked well as a team and had been given the skills and opportunities to make group choices and decisions.• Women appreciated the support within the group particularly in relation to undertaking the night time audits• Relationships across the CSA group have been sustained between group meetings and there is a lot of energy for taking forward CSA work in other areas• One woman was extremely active outside of the group leading on local activities in the park (sporting and cultural)• Women felt that they had developed the skills to undertake Community Safety Audits. These skills could be applied in other areas. Functioning independently as a group was not seen as feasible mainly due to time commitments
--	---

	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• 5 out of 6 respondents scored 5 for working as a self directed group with 1 scoring 4 <p>Women are knowledgeable about the policy structures in their neighbourhoods</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Through the CSA training and local presentations women described building up a lot of knowledge about how decisions are made locally• Women were confident about who to contact when liaising on Community Safety issues.• Women were aware of the role of neighbourhood wardens, police community safety officers and local steering groups (including the A6 project concerned with the regeneration of the local area)• Some respondents indicated that local knowledge could be further strengthened• 3 respondents scored 4 and 2 scored 3 <p>Women are knowledgeable about community safety issues</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Women described their knowledge in relation to the CSA and the safety hazards that they had identified• Some women had accessed community safety information from the local community centre magazine and free newspapers• There was limited knowledge in relation to local community safety policy documents and the role of the MSP Policy Development Worker• Some women felt that the CSA work needed to feature more strongly in the local Crime and Disorder Newsletter• The CSA work could be applied more widely to extend women's knowledge in relation to community safety and continue to build up confidence• 3 respondents scored 4 and 2 scored 5
--	--

	<p>Women are able to facilitate community safety audits</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Women described the CSA training as extremely comprehensive and felt that there was enormous scope for applying their skills more widely. • • Members of the CSA group thought there may be scope for taking forward independent CSA work in the next phase of the project (focusing on building confidence and individual facilitation/group management skills) • Women thought the Manchester based conference “Valuing Gender in Regeneration” was very successful and found there to be a lot of interest in the CSA process • 3 respondents scored 4 whilst 3 scored 3
<p>Implementation of the audit findings</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The CSA group developed a very effective story board presentation for highlighting key findings from the audit process • A wide range of presentations have taken place including: the Crowfort Park Festival, Home Zones Street Party, Longsight Levenshulme Local Action Partnership, Longsight Ward Performance Panel, Valuing Gender in Regeneration Conference, Making Safer Places Launch in Bristol, Manchester Methodist Housing Group • The project has been considered to be a local success particularly as many of the recommendations have been taken on board by local planners and work to the pedestrian crossing in Northmoor Road and the tunnel are considered to be work in progress • The strong linkage between the “Women Voices” theme culminating in the “Women’s Voices event and involvement of local Policy Officers has ensured that the project has influenced local policy and practice in relation to Community Safety

4. Promoting a Gender Perspective

Key findings:

- The PDW undertook extensive initial research and networking (local, national and international) in relation to Gender Mainstreaming
- A successful joint training event was undertaken with Oxfam ReGender in Manchester entitled "Valuing Gender in Regeneration". The event was well attended.
- The "Valuing Gender in Regeneration" Conference produced a set of practical steps to be taken forward at a local level. Both Manchester and Bristol MSP need to ensure that these steps are followed up.
- Many publications, articles and good practice toolkits were researched and circulated to local partners across Bristol and Manchester in relation to Gender Mainstreaming
- A comprehensive baseline survey format was developed in relation to gender awareness, impact assessment and evaluation.
- Findings from each local baseline survey indicates that whilst there is a strong commitment to gender awareness/gender mainstreaming few of the good practice areas are currently being implemented
- The level of focus on Gender across Bristol is minimal. Whilst all new policies are Equalities Impact Assessed there is limited professional knowledge of the value or purpose of Gender Mainstreaming.
- Within Manchester there are plans to integrate Gender Impact Assessments into Equality Standards.
- Both Manchester and Bristol identified the need to undertake local professional training on Gender Mainstreaming. The MSP needs to promote a stronger link between local policies and national obligations to meet EU and Central Government Standards on Equalities
- Policy Development Work has not yet started in London so there has been no review of practice in this area

4.1 Background

A key element of the Policy Development Work (as outlined in the Business Plan) was to work across the three locations in promoting a gender perspective particularly in relation to Community Safety policy and practice.

4.2 The extent of the work

The paper review of work undertaken by the PDW found that considerable initial research and networking had been undertaken on Gender Mainstreaming. Specific achievements relevant to taking forward Gender Mainstreaming at a local level include:

- a) Links made with the Oxfam UK Poverty Programme's ReGender
- b) Project Membership of the Oxfam ReGender National Advocacy Group
- c) The development of a comprehensive baseline survey in relation to gender awareness, impact assessments and evaluation
- d) Research and circulation of the most relevant and useful resources/publications in relation to promoting a gender

perspective as part of the MSP project. Some of the publications cited the work of the Women's Design Service in relation to gender mainstreaming and integrating gender and race into local and regional planning systems. Publication research included: Report on Gender Auditing and Mainstreaming (University of West England), the RTPI Toolkit, EuroFem Toolkit for mobilising women into local and regional development (Helsinki University of Technology, 2000), Secure by Design, supplementary planning guidance (source?), Women and public transport (source?)

- e) The production of a paper entitled "Policy Position on the Disaggregation of Data." (May 2003)
- f) **Undertaking a joint training event with Oxfam ReGender in Manchester on 15 October 2003 entitled "Valuing Gender in Regeneration."** The Purpose of the event was to examine gender aware approaches in relation to regeneration, network and share experiences of work on gender and to identify barriers and opportunities for including women and men's separate concerns in regeneration practice.
The event was well attended (80 participants from statutory, voluntary and community sectors). A full report outlining the workshop based discussions and key outcomes from the event has been produced, available through Oxfam ReGender. Significant outcomes from the day included agreement on the practical steps that need to be taken forward at a local level, these included:
 - o Collection of sex disaggregated statistics and indicators in order to get a real picture of how women and men live their everyday lives
 - o Re-thinking priorities and identifying gender gaps
 - o Developing organisational know how on equality
 - o Developing appropriate tools supported by practical training
 - o Developing inclusive partnership structures
 - o Setting and monitoring objectives that take gender into account
 - o Engaging women at levels of the planning process

Solutions to overcoming barriers for integrating gender into regeneration/local community safety plans and decision making processes included:

- Using opportunities such as EU requirements of gender mainstreaming within major funds, the Equality Standard for local government, Equal Opportunities Policies and the Government's responsibility to meet the obligations, as a signatory, relating to the UN Beijing Platform for Action (obligations include regular statistical publication on gender and use of gender sensitive data in the formulation of policy)

- Develop key performance indicators on gender, women, community development and diversity
- Work with local champions in decision making to open up the debate about gender impact assessments
- Build awareness of practitioners through guidance examples, toolkits and promotion of gender balance

4.3 Review of practice at a local level

Bristol

Review area	Key findings
The publication/circulation of relevant articles and publications	<p>Most respondents reported receiving and reading copies of the MSP steering group minutes. These were found to be a useful means of keeping briefed of the projects progress in Bristol and Manchester. Other publications/articles that had been read and which received positive feedback were:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Millpond Interim Report (2004) with recommendations. Whilst the Interim Report has been widely circulated this review found that there is still a need to find a way of integrating the findings into mainstream policy. The project is not yet locked into any major local priority/theme that would ensure a sustainable future for Gender Mainstreaming locally. Awareness of Gender Mainstreaming needs to be raised as part of a local professional training programme alongside the development of clearer standards for gender audit and mainstreaming (in relation to all local policies and practices) • Local presentation documents (used to promote the CSA findings) • Local articles for the neighbourhood renewal newsletter • The RTPI Gender Audit and Mainstreaming Report and the EuroFem Toolkit
Impact of policy development work on local policies	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Feedback from respondents indicates a concern that whilst the presentations on the CSA have been well received there is little evidence of action being taken on the recommendations. The Equalities Team were seen to have a key role in ensuring

	<p>that Gender Mainstreaming moved higher up the local agenda.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Whilst good practice toolkits on gender auditing and mainstreaming had been circulated there was no evidence of this knowledge being taken forward at a local level• The baselines survey in relation to policy/practice and gender awareness indicated that 4 out of 11 organisations produced gender disaggregated statistics, 1 out of 11 organisations produced publications on women and gender issues (Bristol Women Say), 1 out of 11 organisations is building research networks on women and gender (VOSCUR), 3 out of 11 organisations evaluated policy outcomes on the basis of gender, 2 out of 11 organisations commission gender research projects, 1 out of 11 organisations undertake Gender Impact Assessment work (Equality Impact Assessments), 7 out of 11 organisations reported that they had a commitment to improving gender awareness. The database entry findings indicate that there is considerable work to be undertaken in relation to gender awareness at a policy level• The Oxfam ReGender/WDS one day conference on "Valuing Gender in Regeneration" had been well received providing practical solutions for taking Gender Mainstreaming forward at a local level. However, none of these solutions have been considered in depth locally, this is a significant area of work to be taken forward by the MSP project• The knowledge on European, National and local standards in relation to Gender and Equality is evident but still not considered a priority. As the local government will be required to increasingly fulfil obligations in this area there is enormous scope for the project to re-frame the policy development work – placing gender centre stage. One challenge for the project is to make the connections for local policy makers and promote the benefits of gender auditing and mainstreaming (citing the CSA as one successful method that could be applied
--	---

	<p>more widely)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The CSA has not currently influenced local Community Safety Policy or practice
<p>Level of Gender Impact Assessment Work</p>	<p>Community Safety Audit</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The CSA was seen as Gender Impact Assessment Work finding that women and men make different usage of the built environment at different times of the day. For women road safety and street crime were seen as major concerns. Whilst the findings were seen as providing useful gender information this example has not been linked to any planning process. • The next audit needs to fit more clearly with a local priority so that it can be seen as a Gender Impact Assessment exercise with outcomes that can provide information linked to local standards. • It may be that the training and awareness raising work with professionals/policy makers needs to be undertaken prior to the next CSA. <p>Impact Assessment for Gender</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All new local policies are supposed to be Equalities Impact Assessed. However, there was concern that the level of focus on gender was minimal when compared to race as part of the Social Inclusion Agenda • There is significant scope for working with the Equalities Team in taking forward GIA work across Bristol. • Most importantly, awareness raising in relation to GIA as part of Gender Mainstreaming will need to be undertaken

Manchester

Review area	Key findings
<p>The publication/circulation of relevant articles and publications</p>	<p>Reports and articles that local officers and women were aware of included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The steering group minutes for the MSP project • The Safety in Northmoor Interim Report (September 2003) • Local presentation documents (used to promote the CSA findings) including the story board • The articles in Community Renewal and Green Spaces that cite the CSA work undertaken in Manchester as an example of good practice in relation to improving community safety (utilising gender aware approaches) • Articles in the Northmoor Community Association Magazine • Publicity materials associated with promoting the audit findings (Crowfort Park Festival) • Publicity linked to the "Women's Voices" workshop and the "Valuing Gender in Regeneration" conference • The "Valuing Gender in Regeneration" Conference report with key recommendations <p>Key points:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There was no mention of the wider resources promoted as part of the PDW in relation to national and international toolkits for Gender Mainstreaming • The CSA was seen as something more practical than policy development work. Whilst the "Valuing Gender in Regeneration" conference was held in Manchester the wider discussion points from the event in relation to gender mainstreaming would benefit from being applied at a local level
<p>Impact of policy development work on local policies</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The impact of policy development work was mainly described in relation to the outcomes from the CSA and responses to recommendations.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• The interim report was seen as influencing local thinking (particularly in the Crime and Disorder Team/Social Inclusion Team)• The work has also influenced thinking at a strategic level with lead member commitment for supporting the local project• The policy worker was described as being very successful in engaging with the right senior people, engaging community partnerships, women's organisations, community and voluntary groups• The baseline survey in relation to policy/practice and gender awareness indicated that 4 out of 20 organisations produced gender disaggregated statistics, 1 out of 20 organisations produced publications on women and gender issues, 2 out of 20 organisations were committed to building research networks on women and gender, 2 out of 20 organisations said they would sometimes evaluate policy outcomes on the basis of gender, 1 out of 20 organisations would undertake commissioning of gender research projects, 1 out of 20 organisations reported undertaking consultation work on women and gender issues, no organisations reported undertaking Gender Impact Assessment work, 5 out of 20 organisations were committed to improving gender awareness in their organisation, 4 organisations thought there would be a case for promoting gender awareness sometimes whilst 11 organisations did not see this as a priority.• These findings indicate that whilst the MSP CSA work has been successful and influenced local thinking there is a lot more work to be done with local organisations in making the case for Gender Mainstreaming.• There needs to be a wider awareness of national and international policy and key approaches in relation to Gender Mainstreaming
--	--

<p>Level of Gender Impact Assessment Work</p>	<p>Level 2 of Equalities Standards</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Gender Impact Assessments will be incorporated into the Council's work on local priorities action plans. It will be important for the Policy Development Worker to liaise with the Social Inclusion Team on how GIA's will be developed locally and the degree to which local women will be involved• Many of the local area partnerships are described as male dominated. Whilst the project has enabled people to listen to women's voices and sparked an interest in Gender Impact Assessment Work one professional indicated that more training is needed locally• Given the baseline survey findings considerable changes in local practice may be required.• A focus on professional training through the MSP project in conjunction with the Social Inclusion Team may ensure that there is an in depth understanding of what Gender Mainstreaming means in practice <p>Taking forward the solutions from the "Valuing Gender in Regeneration" conference</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• A number of key solutions were presented in the final conference report• The PDW has a key role to play in working with local policy makers and organisations in implementing these solutions
---	---

London

- Whilst contact has been established no Policy Development Work has yet begun in the EC1 New Deal Area.
- A wide range of contacts have been established with community and voluntary organisations and women's organisations in Islington.
- As a London based organisation WDS has very good relationships established with a number of the London based partnerships and planning forums (Women's Resource Centre, London Women's Planning Forum etc)

5. Promoting work with organisations to engage with women

Key findings:

- A wide range of contacts were made with statutory and voluntary organisations across Manchester and Bristol including many women's groups
- Many of the women participating in the CSA training were also linked into local women's partnerships, networks and forums
- There is no evidence of peer training across Manchester or Bristol to date.
- Whilst there have been a considerable number of community presentations on the MSP and CSA findings across Bristol and Manchester there has been limited community training
- The project has been successful in promoting contact with organisations working with women, older women and women with disabilities
- The MSP project exceeded its target of training 40 professionals across 40 organisations on Gender Mainstreaming by November 2004.
- Whilst there have been a range of training/awareness raising events held in Manchester and London there has not been an event/conference in Bristol
- There is a need to take forward tailored local training for professionals and community organisations in relation to Gender Mainstreaming

5.1 Background

- The MSP Business Plan (2002-2005) indicates that a total of 2 peer training courses involving 10 individuals will have been completed by November 2004.
- The Business Plan also sets a target for completing 4 professional training courses targeting 40 individuals across 40 organisations by November 2004

5.2 Links established between women and local organisations

- Baseline contact information for Bristol and Manchester is extremely comprehensive and indicates that a wide number of community organisations including women's groups have engaged with the project. However, there is no separate database or record in relation to the impact of the project on local women's groups or details of how the project has promoted links between local women and local organisations
- Many of the women involved in the Community Safety Audit Training Sessions were represented on different women's groups/forums (e.g. Bristol Women's Forum, Residents Networks, Manchester Women's Network, Friends of Crowfort Park, Local Residents Steering Group etc) providing a natural linkage to some of the key networks/groups and forums.
- The range of contacts incorporate Community Safety Partnerships, Local Strategic Partnerships, Equalities Department's,

Neighbourhood Renewal Teams, Police Community Safety Teams, Community Networks, Community organisations, Black and Minority Ethnic organisations, Women's Networks, Early Years Teams, Housing Departments etc (many of the representatives from these organisations are women)

5.3 A review of training, events and awareness raising activity

Community Training

- A number of community presentations were undertaken across Bristol and Manchester including organisations like Saathi Asian Women's Group, Bristol Women's Forum, Manchester Women's Network, local Resident Networks etc
- A workshop on community safety for disabled women was undertaken by MSP with People First in Bristol. A group of women with learning difficulties were asked to grade environments according to how safe they felt
- There is scope for undertaking wider community training, particularly with women's groups or those working directly with women

Professional Training

- The MSP project has far exceeded its target of reaching 40 professionals across 40 organisations by November 2004. The PDW has been effective in raising the profile of the project at a local and national level via a number of key events and conferences. Significant events have included:

Labour Party Women's Conference.

- This event served to raise awareness in relation to the MSP Project, the safety audit process and its associated benefits, women's concerns around Crime and Disorder Partnerships, gender and regeneration.

LSE Cities Programme Event

- This awareness day sought to highlight the purpose of Gender Mainstreaming in relation to city planning/design and community safety.
- The day examined definitions of community safety, building capacity in communities, designing spaces with safety in mind, building the capacity of planners/policy makers and professionals in relation to gender awareness.

London Women and Planning Forum (The 24 hour city seminar)- 37 participants

- This seminar examined the issues facing women in relation to the development of a 24 hour city particularly in relation to safety

Women's Voices Conference (Manchester) – 16 participants

- Sixteen women attended the workshops which ran for 1 hour and 10 minutes. This was an experiential workshop focussed on women selecting areas across Manchester where they felt safe and unsafe.
- The event involved analysing women's views and putting forward recommendations.

Valuing Gender in Regeneration Conference (in partnership with Oxfam ReGender) – 85 participants

- This was an extremely well organised and well attended event.
- The purpose of the day was to learn about gender in regeneration and what a gender aware approach has to offer, share experiences of working on gender and regeneration and identify barriers/opportunities for including gender in current regeneration practice.
- Case studies were utilised to highlight current practice drawing on experiences from across the country (Cae Mawr Group, Wales, Northmoor Road Community Safety Audit Groups, Manchester, WDS, Regional Action West Midlands, Oxfam ReGender)
- A conference report with recommendations for local practitioners has been produced.

Tower Hamlets College (Community Development Event)

- The purpose of the event was to examine how community groups/networks can be enabled to participate equally in discussions and activities with policy and decision makers.
- There was also a focus on maximising the skills and expertise of people within the group (building confidence in community knowledge)

6. Local, Regional and National Networks on Community Safety

Key findings:

- The PDW was successful in pursuing contacts and information on networks at a local, national and international level
- An extensive range of information and resources were gathered in relation to Gender Mainstreaming and good practice models for women's community safety networks
- Work on developing Community Safety Networks has not yet begun. A number of useful ideas for taking this work forward were generated by the MSP Steering Group and the PDW/TDW prior to leaving (including making stronger connections between the local MSP project and national/international organisations)

6.1 A review of practice

The paper review indicates that a large body of initial research and significant number of contacts were made at the beginning of the project. The PDW pursued contacts and information at a local (Manchester, Bristol and London), National (government departments and national organisations such as the Neighbourhood Initiatives Foundation, Oxfam UK Poverty Programme, Crime Concern, Freeform etc) and international level (NGO's, European Union, European Policies Research Centre, Woman Kind, Women in Cities International etc).

The initial research gathered a wide range of policy documents, toolkits and examples of good practice in relation to Gender Mainstreaming and promotion of Community Safety Networks. Many of these have been mentioned in the body of this report.

Much of the work in relation to taking forward local, regional and national networks was in its initial stages of development prior to the PDW and TDW leaving in Spring 2004.

6.2 Ideas for strengthening the national networks and profile of the MSP project (feedback from the MSP Steering Group)

- Wider promotion of the CSA model as a Gender Mainstreaming tool.
- Wider promotion of information on how the MSP can influence government thinking
- Making stronger connections between local MSP work and national/international communications
- For the MSP project to be seen as a key resource for taking forward Gender Mainstreaming at a local level (including networks, professional training, accrediting safety audits etc).

- For the MSP project to have a dedicated web page and newsletter (for disseminating information and resources) – this in itself will become a network

6.3 Ideas for taking forward local networks

Prior to leaving the Policy Development Worker prepared a brief paper on ideas for taking forward local networks. There were three ideas

- Develop a training network for women who participated in the audit training
- Develop a training network for women interested in community safety
- Develop a training network for professionals interested in community safety training

6.4 Further suggestions

- With limited resources a lot consideration would need to be given to implementing the above ideas.
- Further suggestions from the steering group included promoting information more widely, E-based communication, dedicated resources to building support networks for women engaging with the project and the development of a local professional training programme in relation to Gender Impact Assessments